Condensed Title:

A Resolution Accepting The City Manager's Recommendation Pursuant To RFP No.40-07/08 For Valet Parking Services, Authorizing The Administration To Enter Into Negotiations, Authorizing The Mayor And City Clerk To Execute An Agreement.

Key Intended Outcome Supported:

Maintain or improve traffic flow and improve parking availability.

Supporting Data (Surveys, Environmental Scan, etc.): There had been an overall increase of 9.57% in total vehicle entries in City garages between 2004 and 2007, thus maintaining the need for ancillary parking services such as valet parking.

Issue:

Shall the Commission Adopt the Resolution?

Item Summary/Recommendation:

The Administration recommended the issuance of a Request for Proposals in order to: (1) increase the financial return to the City. Currently, the City receives $93,400 ($75,000 per year under the $15 valet parking fee and $18,400 under the $20 valet parking fee for specified events as approved by the Mayor and Commission on February 13, 2008) and (2) seek alternative private parking locations for valet parking storage.

On July 16, 2008, the Mayor and City Commission authorized the issuance of a Request for Proposals (RFP) for the Management and Operation of Valet Parking Services at the Miami Beach Convention Center, the Fillmore Miami Beach at the Jackie Gleason Theater, and other city property as may be required.

RFP No. 40-07/08 was issued and sent to over 600 firms and 7 proposals were received, An Evaluation Committee appointed by the City Manager reviewed the proposals and scored and ranked them based on the published evaluation criteria. The Committee reconvened and was provided presentations form the top four proposers. The Committee unanimously ranked AAA Parking as the top-ranked firm.

Adopt the Resolution.

Advisory Board Recommendation:

N/A

Financial Information:

Source of Funds:

OBPI

	Amount	Account	Approved
1		This is a revenue generating contract. No account number is required	
2			
3			
4			
Total			

Financial Impact Summary:

City Clerk's Office Legislative Tracking:

Gus Lopez, Procurement

Sign-Offs:

Department Director	Assistant City Manager	City Manager
SF	TH PDW	JMG

T: \AGENDA\2009\Feb25\Consent\ValetSummary.doc

MIAMIBEACH

City of Miami Beach, 1700 Convention Center Drive, Miami Beach, Florida 33139, www.miamibeachfl.gov

COMMISSION MEMORANDUM

TO: Mayor Matti Herrera Bower and Members of the City Commission

FROM: Jorge M. Gonzalez, City Manager

DATE: February 25, 2009

SUBJECT: **A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA, ACCEPTING THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE CITY MANAGER RELATIVE TO THE RANKING OF VALET PARKING OPERATORS, PURSUANT TO REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS (RFP) NO. 40-07/08, FOR THE MANAGEMENT AND OPERATION OF VALET PARKING SERVICES AT THE MIAMI BEACH CONVENTION CENTER, THE FILLMORE MIAMI BEACH AT THE JACKIE GLEASON THEATER, AND OTHER CITY PROPERTY AS MAY BE REQUIRED; AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATION TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE TOP-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, SELIG PARKING, INC. D/B/A AAA PARKING; AND IF UNSUCCESSFUL IN NEGOTIATING AN AGREEMENT WITH THE TOP-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATION TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE SECOND-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, FIRST CLASS PARKING, LLC; AND IF UNSUCCESSFUL IN NEGOTIATING AN AGREEMENT WITH THE SECOND-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATION TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE THIRD-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, PARK ONE OF FLORIDA, LLC; AND FURTHER AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT UPON COMPLETION OF SUCCESSFUL NEGOTIATIONS BY THE ADMINISTRATION.**

ADMINISTRATION RECOMMENDATION

Adopt the Resolution

KEY INTENDED OUTCOMES SUPPORTED

Maintain or improve traffic flow and improve parking availability

ANALYSIS

It is the City of Miami Beach's intent to retain the highest quality valet parking service for the patrons of The Fillmore Miami Beach at the Jackie Gleason Theater, 1700 Washington Avenue, Miami Beach, Florida ("Theater"); at the Miami Beach Convention Center, 1901 Convention Center Drive, Miami Beach, Florida ("Convention Center"), and at other sites within the City of Miami Beach.

The City of Miami Beach ("City") has contracted valet parking services for these venues since October 1, 1986, and the City wishes to continue providing such parking services to patrons of both facilities, even when events are scheduled simultaneously at both facilities.

The current Concession Agreement was awarded to Gold Star Parking System, Inc. on January 12, 2005. In 2006, Gold Star informed the City of a pending transaction that would transition a majority interest of its corporation from Gold Star to First Class Parking, Inc. and pursuant to their Concession Agreement with the City requested approval to assign its Concession Agreement with

the City to First Class Parking, Inc. On January 17, 2007, the Mayor and Commission approved the Consent to Assignment from Gold Star Parking to First Class Parking.

RFP PROCESS

On July 16, 2008, the Mayor and City Commission authorized the issuance of a Request for Proposals (RFP) for the Management and Operation of Valet Parking Services at the Miami Beach Convention Center, the Fillmore Miami Beach at the Jackie Gleason Theater, and other city property as may be required.

RFP No. 40-07/08 was issued on July 25, 2008, and uploaded in the Bidsync system, which in turn, transmitted notices to over 614 firms or individuals registered for applicable commodity codes pursuant to the scope of the RFP. Additionally, the RFP was posted in BidNet, the City's bid notification agency, as well as e-mailed to over 15 firms. This outreach resulted in the receipt of proposals from the following firms:

Selig Parking, Inc. d/b/a AAA Parking
Boca Parking Systems, Inc
Double Park, LLC
First Class Parking LLC
Grossy Parking, Inc.
Millennium Parking, Inc.
Park One of Florida, LLC

On September 17, 2008, the City Manager via Letter to Commission No. 234-2008, appointed an Evaluation Committee (the "Committee"), consisting of the following individuals:

Sidney Goldin, MB Resident/Neighborhood Leadership Academy Graduate
Jo Manning, MB Resident/Neighborhood Leadership Academy Graduate
Max Sklar, CMB Director of Tourism, Culture, and Development
James Sutter, CMB Internal Auditor
Laura Veitia, MB Resident/Neighborhood Leadership Academy Graduate

The Committee convened on September 26, 2008, and was provided with an overview of the project, information relative to the City's Cone of Silence Ordinance and the Government in the Sunshine Law. The Committee discussed the evaluation criteria to be utilized as outlined in the RFP.

- Proposer's experience with similar contracts: 25%
- Fixed Monthly Payments to the City: (Committee to evaluate proposals as to direct financial return as a resuilt of the agreement and any indirect financial return and/or benefit to the City as a result of proposals suggesting alternate parking space use under Alternate Two: 25%
- Completeness of Proposed Operational Plan: 20%
- Qualifications of Personnel/Staffing Pattern: 15%
- Evidence of Financial Stability: 15%

After discussing the pros and cons of each proposal, the Committee proceeded to score and rank the firms as follows:

Parking Operators	Max Sklar	James Sutter	Sidney Golden	Jo Manning	Laura Veitia
AAA Parking	93 (1)	90 (1)	84 (2)	85 (1)	90 (1)
Boca Parking System, Inc	61 (6)	73 (6)	71 (5)	61 (5)	66 (5)
Double Park LLC	70 (5)	86 (3)	74 (4)	73 (4)	69 (4)
First Class Parking Services	80 (3)	88 (2)	87 (1)	80 (2)	83 (3)
Grossy Parking	58 (7)	71 (7)	65 (6)	45 (7)	43 (7)
Millennium Parking LLC	73 (4)	78 (5)	59 (7)	47 (6)	65 (6)
Park One of Florida LLC	86 (2)	85 (4)	84 (3)	77 (3)	85 (2)

The Committee unanimously recommended AAA Parking as the top-ranked firm, and First Class Parking Services as the second-ranked firm. The Committee's ranking of AAA as the top-ranked firm was in large based on the following:

1. **Experience and qualifications.** Although First Class Parking is the current Valet Parking Operator and is familiar with the Miami Beach Convention Center and the Fillmore, the Committee was impressed with the properties that AAA operates nationally and locally. Specifically, AAA operates nearly 250 properties in Florida, Tennessee, Georgia, Alabama, and Missouri. These properties consist of multi-level garages and decks, surface lots and event parking operations and over 40 upscale hotel valet and self-parking locations. Combined, AAA Parking manages over 75,000 parking spaces daily.

AAA currently manages the Westin Diplomat Golf Resort & Spa, and the AAA Four-Diamond Marco Island Resort & Spa. AAA Parking operates parking for the following business centers such as the Georgia World Congress Center, the Georgia Dome, Bank of America Plaza, Northside Hospital and the Atlanta Civic Center.

AAA Parking served as the official parking operator for the 1996 Summer Olympic Games Park-n-Ride Lots. Additionally, AAA Parking served also as the official parking operator for XXXIV Super Bowl (January 31, 2000 in Atlanta).

AAA Parking has acquired and installed CVPS system which consists of bar code based accounting and inventory control equipment designed to expedite valet park and delivery.

2. **Staffing Plan.** The Committee believed that AAA's staff plan would result in the highest level of valet parking services to patrons of The Miami Beach Convention Center, The Fillmore at the Jackie Gleason Theatre of the Performing Arts and other City property. The Committee cited the following reasons for being comfortable with AAA's staffing plan:

The proposed project manager, Vicente Gonzalez, has fifteen years of parking industry experience and has managed multiple properties in South Florida including the Shore Club, the Delano, the Courtyard Ocean Front, and the Westin Diplomat.

AAA Parking will utilize only experienced valet attendants for the City of Miami Beach project. An extensive training program is required of all valet personnel prior to beginning employment regardless of previous experience. AAA Parking realizes the importance of proper training to maintain high service standards. Every employee is subject to a ninety-day probationary period, where zero tolerance rules apply.

Valet parking attendants will be scheduled as needed for the events at the various locations. While staffing requirements will vary based upon the size of the event, adequate staffing will be provided to ensure no customer will wait more than two minutes before being assisted and no more than 10 minutes for delivery of their vehicle. The following staffing ratio shall be utilized based upon the number of cars expected:

Operations Manager	1 per event	Supervisor	1 per 50 cars
Valet Attendant	1 per 15 cars	Cashier	1 per 100 cars

Additional staffing may be added with minimal notice. More than 200 AAA Parking employees are located in the South Florida area.

For the reasons set forth above, the Committee believed that AAA would offer a higher level of service than the current operator, First Class Parking.

3. **Customer Refunds**

AAA Parking shall maintain a 100% customer satisfaction goal. However, in the event a customer is subjected to a wait of more than 15 minutes for the delivery of their car during any standard event, a full refund shall be provided. Location supervisors shall also be empowered to immediately review any customer complaint and refund any dissatisfied customer. Furthermore, customer complaints received by the AAA Parking corporate office shall be reviewed in an expeditious manner and refunds provided along with a written, formal apology letter from the corporate office customer service manager.

Refunds to customers shall be at the expense of AAA Parking and will not be deducted from the guaranteed monthly payment to the City of Miami Beach.

4. **Financial Strength**

AAA's submitted financial statements that provided the Committee with a comfort level that AAA was financially strong. On the other hand, First Class Parking did not provide financial statements, but rather provided a one-page "assurance" letter stating the amounts of money deposited on a monthly basis with their bank. The Committee believed in AAA's ability to refund customers if they were not completely satisfied. AAA's financial statement showed that AAA was financially strong, while there were concerns over First Class Parking's financial strength.

5. **Amounts Payable to the City**

AAA Parking proposed a fixed monthly payment to the City of Miami Beach for the duration of the Agreement in the amount of $120,000 per year payable in 12 monthly installments of $10,000 per month.

First Class Parking proposed $161,000 per year payment payable in 12 monthly installments, the Committee expressed higher levels of satisfaction with AAA's ability to provide excellent services based on their experience and qualifications, financial strength, staffing plan, and key personnel that outweighed the possible increased payment to the City.

The City Manager, in performing due diligence, requested that the Committee reconvene to have an opportunity to listen to presentations and participate in question and answer sessions with the four top-ranked proposers.

At its October 7, 2008 meeting, the City Commission adopted Resolution No 2008-26917 authorizing a month-to-month extension of the concession agreement with First Class Parking, Inc. for valet parking services, following the expiration of the initial term of the agreement on October 31, 2008, upon the same terms and conditions, until such time as the competitive bidding has concluded and the Mayor and City Commission have approved and authorized an award for these services pursuant to the RFP.

The Committee reconvened on January 14, 2009 and was provided with presentations from AAA Parking, First Class Parking Service, LLC, Park One of Florida, LLC, and Double Park LLC. The Committee participated in question and answer sessions with each of the four proposers.

The Committee was asked to score and rank the four proposals based on three out of the five original criteria, as the proposed fixed monthly payments to the City cannot change during the competitive process and are negotiable upon award, and the evidence of financial stability of the firms was established in the initial Committee meeting. The criteria to be considered for the presentations and question and answer session with the four proposers was (for a total potential of 60%):

- Proposer's experience with similar contracts: 25%
- Completeness of Proposed Operational Plan: 20%
- Qualifications of Personnel/Staffing Pattern: 15%

After discussing each of the four presentations, the Committee proceeded to rank and score the firms as follows:

Parking Operators	Max Sklar	James Sutter	Sidney Goldin	Jo Manning	Laura Veitia
AAA Parking	60 (1)	59 (1)	60 (2)	60 (1)	58 (1)
First Class Parking Services	55 (2)	58 (2)	60 (1)	58 (2)	53 (2)
Park One of Florida, LLC	51 (3)	56 (3)	52 (4)	50 (3)	50 (3)
Double Park LLC	48 (4)	48 (3)	55 (3)	35 (4)	40 (4)

The Committee unanimously recommended AAA Parking as the top-ranked firm, First Class Parking Services as the second-ranked firm, and Park One as the third-ranked firm. The recommendation for AAA Parking mirrored all the reasons outlined above as a result of the initial Committee meeting, as well as their satisfaction with the presentation by AAA Parking.

CONCLUSION

The Administration recommends that the Mayor and City Commission approve the attached resolution, which recommends the acceptance of the ranking of firms and authorizes the Administration to enter into negotiations with the top-ranked firm of Selig Parking, Inc. d/b/a AAA Parking, and if the Administration is unable to negotiate an agreement with the top-ranked firm, authorize the Administration to negotiate with the second-ranked firm of First Class Parking LLC, and if the Administration is unable to negotiate an agreement with the second-ranked firm, authorize the Administration to negotiate with the third-ranked firm of Park One of Florida, LLC; and further authorize the Mayor and City Clerk to execute an agreement upon the completion of successful negotiations by the Administration.

T:\AGENDA\2009\February25\Consent\ValetParkingMemo.doc

RESOLUTION NO. _____

A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA, ACCEPTING THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE CITY MANAGER RELATIVE TO THE RANKING OF VALET PARKING OPERATORS, PURSUANT TO REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS (RFP) NO. 40-07/08, FOR THE MANAGEMENT AND OPERATION OF VALET PARKING SERVICES AT THE MIAMI BEACH CONVENTION CENTER, THE FILLMORE MIAMI BEACH AT THE JACKIE GLEASON THEATER, AND OTHER CITY PROPERTY AS MAY BE REQUIRED; AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATION TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE TOP-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, SELIG PARKING, INC. D/B/A AAA PARKING; AND IF UNSUCCESSFUL IN NEGOTIATING AN AGREEMENT WITH THE TOP-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATION TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE SECOND-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, FIRST CLASS PARKING, LLC; AND IF UNSUCCESSFUL IN NEGOTIATING AN AGREEMENT WITH THE SECOND-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATION TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE THIRD-RANKED PARKING OPERATOR, PARK ONE OF FLORIDA, LLC; AND FURTHER AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT UPON COMPLETION OF SUCCESSFUL NEGOTIATIONS BY THE ADMINISTRATION

WHEREAS, the initial term of the concession agreement with First Class Parking, LLC for valet parking service is in its first term (three years), expiring on October 31, 2008; and

WHEREAS, at its October 7, 2008 meeting, the City Commission adopted Resolution No 2008-26917 authorizing a month-to-month extension of the concession agreement with First Class Parking, Inc. for valet parking services, following the expiration of the initial term of the agreement on October 31, 2008, upon the same terms and conditions, until such time as the competitive bidding has concluded and the Mayor and City Commission have approved and authorized an award for these services pursuant to the RFP; and

WHEREAS, on July 16, 2008, the Mayor and City Commission authorized the issuance of a Request for Proposals (RFP) for the Management and Operation of Valet Parking Services at the Miami Beach Convention Center, the Fillmore Miami Beach at the Jackie Gleason Theater, and other City property as may be required; and

WHEREAS, on July 25, 2008, RFP No. 40-07/08 was issued; the Procurement Division e-mailed the RFP, uploaded it to both RFPDepot.com and to BidNet, resulting in notices being sent to over 600 firms; and

WHEREAS, on the specified RFP due date of August 28, 2008, the Procurement Division received responses from Selig Parking, Inc. d/b/a AAA Parking; Boca Parking Systems, Inc.; Double Park, LLC; First Class Parking, LLC; Grossy Parking, Inc.; Millennium Parking, LLC; and Park One of Florida, LLC; and

WHEREAS, on September 17, 2008, the City Manager via Letter to Commission No. 234-2008, appointed an Evaluation Committee (the "Committee"), consisting of the following individuals:

Sidney Goldin, MB Resident/Neighborhood Leadership Academy Graduate;
Jo Manning, MB Resident/Neighborhood Leadership Academy Graduate;
Max Sklar, CMB Director of Tourism, Culture, and Development;
James Sutter, CMB Internal Auditor;
Laura Veitia, MB Resident/Neighborhood Leadership Academy Graduate; and

WHEREAS, the Committee convened on September 26, 2008, and was provided with an overview of the RFP, information relative to the City's Cone of Silence Ordinance, Government in the Sunshine Law, and discussed the evaluation criteria to be utilized as outlined in the RFP; and

WHEREAS, the Committee unanimously recommended Selig Parking, Inc. d/b/a AAA Parking as the top-ranked firm, and First Class Parking LLC as the second-ranked firm; and

WHEREAS, the City Manager, in performing due diligence, requested that the Committee reconvene to have an opportunity to listen to presentations and participate in question and answer sessions with the four top-ranked proposers; and

WHEREAS, the Committee re-convened on January 14, 2009, and was provided with presentations from AAA Parking, First Class Parking Service, LLC, Park One of Florida, LLC, and Double Park LLC; and

WHEREAS, the Committee unanimously recommended AAA Parking as the top-ranked firm; First Class Parking Services as the second-ranked firm; and Park One as the third-ranked firm; and

WHEREAS, the City Manager concurs with the Committee's recommendation.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT DULY RESOLVED BY THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA, that the Mayor and City Commission hereby accept the recommendation of the City Manager pursuant to Request for Proposals (RFP) No. 40-07/08 for Valet Parking Services at the Miami Beach Convention Center, the Fillmore Miami Beach at the Jackie Gleason Theater, and Other City Property, as May Be Required; and authorize the Administration to enter into negotiations with the top-ranked parking operator Selig Parking, Inc. d/b/a AAA Parking; and should the Administration not be able to negotiate with the top-ranked parking operator, authorize the Administration to negotiate with the second-ranked parking operator, First Class Parking, LLC; and if unsuccessful in negotiating with the second-ranked parking operator, enter into negotiations with the third-ranked parking operator, Park One of Florida, LLC; and further authorizing the Mayor and City Clerk to execute an agreement upon successful negotiations by the Administration.

PASSED AND ADOPTED this _____ day of _____, 2009.

ATTEST:

_____ _____

CITY CLERK MAYOR

T:\AGENDA\2009\Feb25\Consent\ValetParkingtReso.doc

APPROVED AS TO
FORM & LANGUAGE
& FOR EXECUTION

2/18/09

City Attorney Date